

Durham PreK Governance Committee Meeting NOTES

Jim and Carolyn Hunt Early Childhood Resource Center

March 18, 2021 (9:30am-11:30am)

In Attendance:

Voting Members: Peggy Ball, Leigh Bordley, Xavier Cason, Drew Cummings (Designated by Wendell Davis,) Cathy Collie-Robinson, Deric Boston, Anna Gassman-Pines, Iheoma Iruka, Michelle Lynn, Beth Messersmith, Michael Page, Ben Rose, June Shillito

Non-voting Members: Marsha Basloe, Linda Chappel, Cate Elander, Monnie Griggs, Danielle Johnson, Alex Livas-Dlott, Melinda Rodriguez

Absent: Wendell Davis, Wykesia Glass, Dr. Nakia Hardy, Karen McLeod, Darnella Warthen

Visitors: Eryn Gorang, , Mary Martin

WHAT	NOTES
Welcome and Introductions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome and Introductions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Introduced and welcomed a new Governance Committee member, Michael J. Page, representing the Board of Directors of Durham’s Partnership for Children. Reverend Page is the new Chair for DPFC’s Board. • Reviewed the January 21, 2021 meeting notes.
Action Taken	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance committee members reviewed and approved meeting notes for January 21, 2021.
Durham PreK Update*	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NCPK/DPK Monitoring <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Finishing up NC Pre-K and DPK monitoring <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Due and will be submitted to DCDEE by March 31, 2021 ▪ The final step is virtual monitoring visits. ○ Durham PreK Capacity building is underway. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Director and teacher visits have started. ▪ Creating professional development and quality improvement plans. ○ We had a successful A.S.K. Conference DPK thread. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ DPK and NC Pre-K teachers participated in multi-session professional development, <i>Anti-racist Preschool Education</i> with Dr. Ronda Taylor Bullock from the local group, <i>we are</i> ○ Quality Subcommittee Update <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Drafting a Durham PreK Equity Work Plan ▪ Members identified items to focus on for the next couple of years. Subcommittee members will present to Governance in our May meeting.

Durham PreK Mode of Instruction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Durham Public Schools PreK Classrooms: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Hybrid model began March 15, 2021 (in-person and virtually) ○ For PreK classrooms some programs are about 50% virtually and 50% in-person • Private Childcare PreK Classrooms: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Hybrid model continues (in-person and virtually) ○ About 70% is in-person and 30% virtual. The majority of private childcare students attend in-person. • Durham Head Start Classrooms: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Hybrid model with reduced class sizes began in January 13, 2021
Child Care Workforce Study	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentation on the NC Child Care Workforce Study by Mary Martin, Vice President of System Research and Development at CCSA, with a focus upon Durham’s data <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Working in Early Care and Education in Durham County – 2019 Workforce Study <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provides an in-depth study of what the workforce looked like before the pandemic ▪ The last time we had a county specific workforce study was in 2003. ▪ The Division of Child Development and Early Education funded the workforce study. ○ Describes the current (pre-COVID) early care and education workforce (birth to five) and programs including both centers and homes. Informs efforts to support and grow the child care workforce. • Methodology <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Population: February 2019 DCDEE licensing files minus school age only programs. ○ Centers <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Divided into counties ▪ Larger counties sampled based on star levels, size and auspice ▪ Smaller counties used entire population ○ Homes <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Divided into 3 geographical areas (Urban, Rural and Suburban) ▪ Sampled based on star levels ○ Surveyed Directors, Teachers/Assistants & Family Child Care Providers ○ Surveys based on forms previously used for workforce studies ○ Questions included working conditions, demographics, education, experience and wages • Response Rates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 71% response rate for Durham County center directors (74% statewide) ○ 59% participation rate for Durham County teaching staff (40% statewide) ○ 71% response rate from family child care providers

- Results
 - We are unable to tell you what the workforce looks like now as a result of the pandemic. We can however, tell you what the workforce looked like before the pandemic.
 - Statewide Child Care Centers at a Glance
 - Over 3,900 centers provide care for nearly 177,000 birth to five years olds.
 - 65% have an assistant director
 - 43% have at least one educational support staff
 - 64% participate in CACFP
 - 31% of centers have at least one NC Pre-K classroom
 - Durham County Child Care Centers
 - Approximately 140 licensed centers provide early care and education for nearly 6,500 birth to five year olds
 - 64% have an assistant director
 - 55% have at least one educational support staff
 - 64% participate in CACFP
 - 16% of Durham Centers have at least one NC Pre-K classroom
 - Child Care Centers Star Level & Auspice
 - Star Level
 - 20% of Durham centers are 4-star (15% enrollment)
 - 22 % statewide centers are 4-star (19% enrollment)
 - 53% of Durham centers are 5-star (67% enrollment)
 - 48% statewide centers are 5-star (54% enrollment)
 - Auspice
 - 78% of Durham centers are for-profit (88% enrollment)
 - 55% for-profit centers statewide (59% enrollment)
 - 19% of Durham centers are non-profit (11% enrollment)
 - 20% non-profit centers statewide (23% enrollment)
 - 3% of Durham centers are public (1% enrollment)
 - 25% public centers statewide (18% enrollment)
 - Statewide Child Care Homes at a Glance
 - Over 1,500 homes provide care for nearly 6,300 children (0-5)
 - 63% accept children who receive subsidy
 - 76% participate in CACFP

- Types of care provided
 - 56% evening
 - 30% overnight
 - 24% weekend
 - 14% sick child
 - 27% legal holidays
 - 71% drop-in care
- Profile of the Workforce
 - In Durham County 84% of teaching staff are people of color
 - Annual family income below \$30K is 51% in Durham
 - Annual family income below \$50K is 85% in Durham
- Education of the Child Care Workforce
 - About 32% of Assistant Teachers in Durham have an associate’s degree or higher
 - About 61% of Teachers in Durham have an associate’s degree or higher
 - About 88% of Directors in Durham have an associate’s degree or higher

○ Durham Center Wage Scales

	2019 Median Wage	2009 Wage in 2009 Dollars	2009 Wage in 2019 Dollars	Percent Change 2009-2019
Starting Assistant Teacher Wage	\$10.00	\$8.50	\$10.08	-0.8%
Highest Assistant Teacher Wage	\$12.50	\$10.00	\$11.88	5.2%
Starting Teacher Wage	\$12.00	\$10.00	\$11.88	1.0%
Highest Teacher Wage	\$15.00	\$12.50	\$14.84	1.1%

○ Self-Reported Earnings-Durham Workforce

	2019 Wage	2009 Wage in 2019 Dollars	Percent Increase 2009-2019

Assistant Teacher	\$12.00	\$10.69	12.3%
Teacher	\$13.50	\$13.16	2.6%
Director	\$19.23	\$19.19	0.2%

- Employment Benefits in Centers
 - About 29% of teaching staff in Durham County does not have any health benefits.
- Workforce Turnover
 - 1 in 5 teachers leave their centers each year in Durham County
 - About 1 in 3 Teachers say they will leave the field in the next 3 years
 - About 1 in 10 Directors say they will leave the field in the next 3 years
- Keeping the workforce in the field
 - Durham Directors
 - Better pay (50%)
 - Stronger network with other directors/professionals (50%)
 - Fewer hours per week (31%)
 - Durham Teaching Staff
 - Better pay (71%)
 - Better benefits (50%)
 - More opportunities for professional growth (35%)
 - More support working with children with behavioral challenges (30%)
- Statewide county reports
 - www.childcareservices.org/research/workforce-studies/working-in-early-care-and-education-statewide-workforce-studies/2019-north-carolina-child-care-workforce-study/
 - Questions/data requests: marym@childcareservices.org
- Q & A/Conversation Highlights
 - Statewide non-profit centers seem to be larger scale than they are in Durham. Any thoughts/explanations?
 - Durham has historically had a high number of local business owners, many minority owned, operating child care programs. We have a lower number of for profit chain programs also. The locally owned programs tend to be smaller centers than chains.
 - Do we have enough historical data on these data points to see if/how DPK is changing employment (and employee) dynamics (e.g. education levels/certifications)?
 - We are tracking the data, but do not have enough yet. We have quite a bit of anecdotal info about the impact.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Are public programs inclusive to Head Start and Durham Public Schools? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Any licensed public school, Head Start and Early Head Start ▪ For this study, only we only surveyed licensed programs. ○ Beneficial to have a comparative analysis of system wide data for Durham County, the State and Durham PreK <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Important for County commissioners and potential investors to see how Durham PreK is impacting the early childhood workforce. ▪ How does DPK compare to metrics? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Collecting DPK teacher and director data, but not countywide. Potential area for further data collection and research.
Durham PreK SY21-22 Application	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Online application released February 15, 2021 ● New web page – Durham PreK Application <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Online application link ○ Video walkthroughs of application tool ○ Video FAQs about required application documents ○ FAQs from family application information session ○ All available in English and Spanish ○ Virtual application appointments available ● Benefits of Online Application Tool <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Streamline application process for families and pre-k partners ○ Allows families to receive updates as their application moves through the process ○ Transparency across pre-k partners ○ Allows for work flow management ○ Application data stored in one system ○ Although we have an online application we still provide individual support <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Paper applications available upon request ● Durham PreK SY21-22 Application <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 621 applications started as of Sunday, March 14, 2021 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 6 in eligibility stage ▪ 38 are ineligible ▪ 262 are in the process of completing the application ▪ 50 initial review by CCSA ▪ 170 reviewed and missing documentation

- 54 DPfC's 1st review round
- 22 DPS' review round
- 19 DPfC's 2nd review round

○ Application Data

SY 20-21 Application Data	SY 21-22 Application Data
Paper application available online 12/15/19 Appointments began 1/13/20	Online application available 2/15/21
Number of applications received by 2/28/20 - 577	Number of applications started by 2/28/21 - 550
Number of applications received after 4 weeks of appointments - 172	Number of applications started after 4 weeks - 621

Durham PreK SY21-22 Budget

- SY 20-21 COVID-19 Relief Payments
 - Make a recommendation to Durham County for unspent instructional funds
 - Current DPK instructional Services budget projects \$80,000 - \$100,000 in unspent funds
 - DCDEE – NC Pre-K COVID-19 Relief Payments
 - For NC Pre-K classrooms with 1 or more allocated spaces by February 15, 2021
 - \$3,453 per classroom with at least 1 NC Pre-K student by 2/15/21
 - \$4,315 if classroom provided in-person services prior to January 31, 2021
 - DPK has one classroom without an NC Pre-K allocation. They will not receive a COVID relief payment from the State.
 - Review of strategies for potential COVID-19 relief payments for programs offering in person instruction
 - Chart to Consider for COVID-19 Relief Payments

To Consider for COVID-19 Relief Payments		
Strategy	Accomplishes	Considerations
Provide lead teacher and assistant teacher pay bonuses	Supports teachers providing in-person and virtual instruction during pandemic	Does not address additional experienced by programs due to the pandemic
Provide one-time relief payments (equal amount distributed across qualifying programs) to apply towards PPE and COVID-related expenses	Supports programs with their increased costs due to COVID-19 (e.g., PPE, filters, building modifications)	Less accountability about how payments are used by each program

Provide PPE and classroom supplies to programs. Programs can request materials through order form (up to maximum amount)	Support programs to offset costs of PPE and supplies during the pandemic	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased administrative burden/cost of processing order forms and distributing supplies • PPE for classrooms has been purchased by DPfC
--	--	---

- In April NC Pre-K will release a one-time COVID relief payment to all sites
- Separate from NC Pre-K’s COVID-19 Relief payment, all licensed programs will get 2 operational grants from DCDEE. On average if you are a center with up to 40 children and are a 4 or 5 star you will receive 2 payments of \$2,880.
 - This is a tiered operational grant. Tiered by star rating and size of program. Must be providing in-person services.
- Meeting charge – make a recommendation for unspent instructional funds
 - Identify, discuss and set guiding tenets for potential COVID relief payments
- **Conversation Highlights:**
 - Seems like one of the places programs might be hurting is in salaries, especially if they have not been operational. Assuming the other COVID relief payments are going towards PPE perhaps we can consider off setting some of the financial burdens of teacher salaries.
 - State lawmakers in the last couple of weeks chose not to continue providing bonuses and hazard pay as part of federal funding. As economy begins to ramp up people will have other employment opportunities that will be less stressful and pay more.
 - In light of Mary’s compensation data from 2019 and the turnover rate we should consider strengthening our workforce by providing lead teachers and assistant teacher pay bonuses
 - Reminder that the purpose of the additional \$100,000 was to give CCSA the ability to aim hard at their target spending level without being penalized. We are well within our rights to recommend to the County Manager and Commissioners how to allocate the unused funds.
 - Just to be clear, we can formulate a recommendation that will go to the County, but cannot decide without County approval on how to spend the unused money.
 - Given the current financial landscape the County may decide to use the unused funds elsewhere
 - In our last meeting we talked about 3%, 5% and 7% cut scenarios to Durham PreK. It might be worthwhile for the board to think more broadly about the potential use of additional funds. If we were allowed to carryover the unused money to the next fiscal year and we are given a cut this unused money can potentially absorb some of the cuts.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ In April, we will know for sure how much money will be unused. ○ It might suffice to point out the variety of important ways these funds could be used and to request authority for CCSA and the Governance Committee to apply to the most relevant need moving forward. To make a general request, which will allow us to keep the money but defer the decision making to a later date. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Create a list of possible expenditures for these unused funds
Action Taken	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Motion Approved to request that 2020 – 2021 unspent instructional services funds be spent for the following: 1) pay \$4,315 to the single DPK classroom that will not be eligible to receive a COVID relief payment of \$4,315 from NCDCEE and 2) distribute the remainder of any unspent instructional funds to classrooms for bonus payments to lead teachers and instructional staff. ● Staff will work in consultation with Drew Cummings to prepare a request to the County Manager to realign the funding.
Durham PreK Vision for 2020-2021	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● In January 2020, the Governance Committee reviewed, discussed and affirmed the vision for Durham PreK <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Vision Elements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Expand access & funding ▪ Durham as a recognized model ▪ Increased quality & equity ▪ Engaged & supported early childhood education system ▪ Community buy-in ▪ Strengthened collaborations & partnerships ○ Principles/Values – We believe.... <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provide support for high quality ▪ Teachers are our biggest change agents ▪ Support for leadership & leadership development ▪ Collaboration and partnership ▪ “Nothing about us without us” – involving families and teachers

Durham PreK
SY 21-22 Budget
Considerations

- Think about categories we might prioritize for cuts. Item will be on the top of the agenda in May

To Consider for the Management Budget		
Strategy	Accomplishes	Considerations
Decrease or eliminate capacity building technical assistance (Pipeline)	Reduces costs by reducing personnel	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impacts readiness for expansion • Decreases progress toward high quality programs for children
Decrease support for family engagement	Reduces costs by reducing partner contracts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Family Engagement is an integral component of high quality early education programs • Reduces resources for partner agency
Reduce intensity of technical assistance (TA) for current programs	Reduces costs by eliminating or reducing some components of TA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The investment in CLASS is costly; it's an evidence based tool; focuses upon classroom instruction and relationships
Reduce support services such as translation in languages other than Spanish, web development, outreach	Reduces external purchasing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impacts program implementation • May reduce program visibility • Reduces resources for partner agency

- Please review for May's Governance meeting. We will identify, discuss and set guiding tenets for budget cuts.
- Dig deeper on providing details on how many teachers/children are affected in each option.
- What personnel are affected by each option and identify other potential funding streams
- 3 donations since December on our DPK website
- Build out our fundraising development for long-term sustainability.

Summary and
Adjournments

- The next Governance meeting is on May 20, 2021

*** Agenda items with handouts**