

Durham PreK Governance Committee Meeting NOTES

Held virtually on January 18th, 2024 (9:30am-11:30am)

In Attendance, listed in random order:

Voting Members: Cathy Collie-Robinson, Dr. Iheoma Iruka, Dr. Aleksandra Holod, Michelle Lyn, Xavier Cason, June Shillito, Darnella Warthen, Dr. Deborah Polen Pitman, Brittany Gregory, Tabitha Blackwell, Jason Rutherford, Kate Goodwin, Joy Spencer

Non-voting Members: Dr. Kristi Snuggs, Dr. Linda Chappel, Tammorah Mathis, Monnie Griggs, Meytal Barak, Jena Fuchs, Joy Turner, Jameka Wells; Guests: Tosh Adams, Adrienne Stephens, Maggie West, Brianna Head

WHAT	NOTES
Welcome and Introductions	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Welcome and Introductions<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ A recording of the meeting can be found on our DPK YouTube channel○ Cathy Collie-Robinson and Dr. Linda Chappel welcomed newly appointed Governance Members-<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Jason Jones, Assistant Director of Durham Parks and Recreation was welcomed as a new voting member▪ Meytal Barak, Early Childhood Coordinator for Durham County was also welcomed as a new non-voting member, replacing Cate Elander, the former Coordinator.○ All members then took turns introducing themselves○ Attendance reviewed and meeting quorum verified
Meeting Objectives	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Approve Meeting Notes• Share Program Updates• Review Current Enrollment• Review Current Budget• Review Instructional Assistant Teacher Information and Compensation• Review Results of New Payment Model
*Action Item	<p>Approve Governance Committee notes from May 2023</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Motion by Brittany Gregory, second by second by Dr. Aleksandra Holod• All in favor

**Apprenticeship
Program
Update***

Maggie West, Durham PreK Workforce Manager, provided members with an overview of the apprenticeship program.

- We officially and ceremonially launched the Durham Early Childhood Educator Associate degree apprenticeship program in the fall with an apprenticeship-signing day on November 16, 2023. This was an opportunity to recognize our inaugural cohort of 41 apprentices alongside their 23 mentors and 14 partnering employers. There were over 100 guests at our signing event at Durham Technical Community College.
- Members viewed a [video message from Governor Cooper](#) celebrating the inaugural cohort of 41 apprentices in the Durham Early Childhood Educator Apprenticeship Program for Apprentice Signing Day, November 2023.
- Members viewed a slide show of pictures of our apprentices on our Apprentice Signing Day, November 2023.

By the Numbers:

- 147 current/aspiring educators have expressed interest in completing higher degrees to further their careers in early childhood education
 - 108 are candidates for Durham apprenticeship, including 89 interested in Associate degrees and 19 interested in Bachelor's degrees
 - 41 apprentices have registered to date, supported by 23 mentors at 14 partnering employers
- Our team from CCSA, Durham Tech and El Centro Hispano visited Charlotte Bilingual Preschool to learn more about their apprenticeship program, which has been established for about 3 years and has about 8 participants per year in the program.
 - We also continue to work with North Carolina Central University and UNC Greensboro on developing a Bachelor's degree track within the apprenticeship program. It will be the first early childhood bachelor's degree attainment apprenticeship program in North Carolina. We still have details to work through but have been grateful for their continued collaboration, and excited to build that full pathway towards birth to kindergarten teacher licensure.

Discussion

- Cathy Collie Robinson mentioned on behalf of Durham Tech “we are thrilled with apprenticeship.” The current enrollment in our 100 level courses is very large, and it's all because of apprenticeship. Maggie is working really hard, going out to all the childcare centers and really connecting with our apprentices and then helping them navigate the Durham Tech enrollment and registration process, which is sometimes challenging, so just thrilled with all things apprenticeship and really excited to see it continue to grow and thrive.
- Dr. Linda Chappel praised the apprenticeship program on doing a great job and described how it is serving the community. Linda recently met with the director of the LEAP program, which is a half-day program in Durham and the director was conveying her excitement about having apprentices.

<p>Durham PreK Program Update*</p>	<p>Tammorah Mathis, Director of Durham PreK, reviewed the following highlights from the DPK update that was provided in the meeting handouts:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Durham PreK enrollment in locally funded seats is at 93%. • Durham PreK is gearing up for our 2024-2025 school year application that opens on February 5, 2024. Our first Family Information Session will be held on February 3, 2024. • Be sure to check out our December Newsletters, linked here, featuring interviews with 2020 National Teacher of the Year, Tabatha Rosproy, and Governance Committee member, Beth Messersmith. Rosproy is the first early childhood teacher to win the award and is the keynote speaker for CCSA’s upcoming ASK Conference for early childhood instructional leaders. • Thanks to the generosity of our partner, the Bull City Sigmas, 40 Durham PreK families received free Thanksgiving meals. • The 2024-2026 Request for Applications (RFA) process continues. This is a joint application process between NC Pre-K and DPK to select program sites to host public preschool. Site applications are due January 26, 2024. • City Health awarded Durham a gold medal in the area of High-Quality, Accessible Pre-K for policies that improve access to early childhood education. • On social media, we showcase family testimonials, fun fact Fridays, and weekly recaps. We currently have a paid Facebook advertisement announcing the February application opening. • Durham PreK and NC Pre-K participated in the annual Durham Holiday Parade held December 9, 2023. <p>DPK Site Celebrations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • First Presbyterian Day School has achieved NAEYC accreditation! This is a rigorous process that indicates a true commitment to providing high-quality education and care for young children. Michele Miller-Cox, Director of First Presbyterian Day School is pictured in the handout. • Two site directors successfully attained their CLASS© observer certifications and two have achieved re-certification. The CLASS© tool assesses the quality of teacher and child interactions.
<p>DPK Enrollment and Demographics*</p>	<p>Dr. Linda Chappel, Sr. Vice President, reviewed the report about enrollment in the seats paid for with local funds. This data excludes Head Start and all Durham Public Schools sites. Aggregated data will be provided when the information becomes available.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The data presented are from children who are in a Durham PreK funded seat or NC Pre-K seat at private sites. On this date in the school year, we have 653 seats supported by local Durham PreK funds. • Members reviewed a graphic displaying the breakdown of the braided funding.

- Durham County Government invests in public preschool outside of the Durham PreK budget by funding Durham Public Schools directly. These data described exclude those funds- and are based on funds that come directly into the Durham PreK budget and are distributed through our collaborative process.
- With our coordination and communication with Durham County, we have a goal to grow each year by between 40 and 100 seats.
- DPK has a universal access goal but we prioritize families with greatest needs. Presently, 35% of our enrolled children live in homes with income less than a hundred percent FPL (Federal Poverty Level). Just about half of our families (48%) come from single-parent households and 51% come from 2-parent households—with 1% self-identifying as living in foster parent arrangements. Enrollment is 50 - 50 girls and boys.

***Summary of Tables and Projections Reviewed**

Table 1

Breakdown of Durham PreK seats with braided funding:

- DPK/NCPK: 277 Seats dispersed between 16 sites
- DPK/NCPK/HS: 62 Seats dispersed between 3 sites
- DPK/NCPK/Title 1: 29 Seats dispersed between 4 sites
- DPK/HS: 0 Seats at 1 site
- DPK/Title 1: 14 Seats at 1 site
- DPK Only: 271 seats dispersed between 22 sites

Table 2

PreK Children by Race

- Black/African American: 50%
- White/Caucasian: 33%
- Multi-Racial: 9%
- Pacific Islander: 6%
- American Indian: 2%
- Unknown: 0%

PreK Children by Ethnicity

- Hispanic/LatinX: 26%
- Not Hispanic/LatinX: 74%

Table 3

PreK Children by % FPL

Based on the current data we have 35% of our enrolled children live in homes with income at less than a hundred percent Federal Poverty Level.

- < 100% FPL (35%)
- 100% FPL (30%)
- 200% FPL (11%)
- 300% FPL (11%)
- 400% FPL (12%)

Table 4

Breakdown of Federal Poverty Level (FPL) income for a family of 2 and a family of 4. Families who are at or above 400% FPL are assessed a parent fee based on their income. This parent portion contributes toward the reimbursed amount to the program. Parent fees are assessed as a percentage of income, up to the \$1,400/month reimbursement rate.

Table 5

For context, a chart displayed the annual starting salary of local jobs in the community to help understand the FPL guidelines for Durham PreK.

Table 6

Charts showed the percentage of children enrolled in DPK based on family structure, gender, and home language. 48% of children enrolled are from a single-parent household and 51% come from two-parent households with 1% self-identifying as a foster parent arrangement. Our enrollment is equal for girls and boys. 76% of our enrolled children identify as English being their home language while 19% primary language is Spanish; 1% Arabic, 1% Chinese, and 3% “other.”

Table 7

Provided a breakdown of enrolled children by Zip Code.

Table 8

Displayed who are the local partners of Durham PreK and an updated breakdown of locally funded seats.

Discussion

- Dr. Iheoma Iruka shared her appreciation for the investment in more analysis time to ensure children furthest away or with limited resources are provided with opportunities of quality childcare.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Deborah Polen Pitman was intrigued by the comment about the male/female gender balance although it is not a part of the selection process. She asked if the application process selected participants based on gender, home language, and family structure. • Dr. Chappel responded to Dr. Pitman’s question. We do have some priority groups (such as foster and homeless families). Gender is not considered for placement. We have a universal application process across all programs in Durham. Within this application process, each individual program has entry restrictions or requirements. We look at those factors for each application first, and we work through them to find the best match for a child, the best match to a seat that will meet their needs in the best way possible, for priority placement. We have not been in a situation yet where we were unable to serve a member of a priority group.
<p>DPK Budget*</p>	<p>Joy Turner, Director of Data and Provider Services, reviewed the Durham PreK Budget</p> <p>Table 1 Durham PreK Budget 2020-2024</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In FY 23-24 Commissioners approved an additional \$1,727,864 during budget negotiations, resulting in \$6,857,581, (not including over \$2 million in additional support going directly to Durham Public Schools for preschool classrooms). These new funds support increases in program funding to school sites; additional classroom seats; financial assistance for wrap care; increased professional development; outreach and family support services. • For FY 22-23 Commissioners approved an additional \$973,485 during budget negotiations, resulting in a new total of \$5,129,717, (not including over \$2 million in additional support going directly to Durham Public Schools for preschool classrooms). The bulk of the new funding will support additional instructional services (additional “seats”), with smaller amounts supporting program management costs as well as implementation of a pilot wrap care program. • The FY 21-22 budget funded Durham Pre-K at \$4,156,840, (not including over \$2 million in additional support going directly to Durham Public Schools for preschool classrooms). Of this amount, \$3,233,107 flowed through CCSA directly to providers for instructional services, and the remaining \$923,733 supported a wide variety of system management and system development services, including professional development for teachers and program directors. <p>Table 2 Durham PreK Funding and Seat Capacity</p> <p>Shows the number of seats supported by the local dollars. Seats were reduced in the 2020-2021 school year due to reduced capacity due to COVID-19. Shows the increase in budget for program services and instructional services.</p> <p>Table 3</p> <p>Impact of DPK Parent Fees on Budget. Numbers shown for SY 22-23 numbers are over the full school year. Numbers shown for SY 23-24 numbers are based on 11/1/23 caseload data. Parents are assigned a parent fee when they fall at or above 400% of the</p>

Federal Poverty Level. The parent fee is assessed at 2% of the family's monthly income. This would be an income of \$120,000 per year for a family of 4.

- In Jan 2023, breakdown of DPK Only seats by FPL was the following: 12% <100%, 17% 100-199%, 20% 200-299%, 23% 300-399%, 28% >=400%.
- As of Nov 1 2023, breakdown of DPK Only seats by FPL is the following: 11% <100%, 19% 100-199%, 12% 200-299%, 26% 300-399%, 32% >=400%.
- As of December 2023, the number of children with a parent fee in SY24 is 67 compared to 52 children in SY 23.

Discussion

- Dr. Chappel made the Governance Committee aware of Durham Public Schools' request for 45 seats at the new elementary school opening in August 2024. This request for full funding is unprecedented; however, it is a great opportunity to support our expansion goal. We are in our RFA year, which is the request for applications in the community for programs interested in becoming a DPK site. Sites will not be decided upon until April.
- Cathy Collie-Robinson asked since the RFAs have been sent out, will this process of selection be complete by our March meeting. [They will not.]
- Jameka Wells mentioned that DPS plans to apply in the RFA for Murray-Massenburg to be a site. The funding is a challenge; however in the current budget we have two sites that don't have other funding sources to braid; however, we anticipate those 2 sites may become eligible through the RFA process for both NC Pre-K and Durham PreK funding. If approved, this will allow funding to be spread a little bit further across sites.
- Dr. Deborah Pitman shared that DPS is in the process of completing the RFA. We are undergoing the Growing Together implementation and Murray-Massenburg is a critical school capacity site for the district. DPS plans to open with 3 PreK classrooms which will allow children with special circumstances to attend a self-contained program (PreK - 5th grade). This will minimize the transition between different programs. Pitman reminded the Governance members that funds are not provided by the North Carolina Department of Public Instruction or the Legislature for preschool. These funds are only for kindergarten through 12th grade. No state dollars are allocated directly to public school preschool services and DPS relies heavily on funds from NC PreK, Durham PreK, and federal dollars.
- June Shillto asked Jameka if sites are supposed to input the maximum amount of seats their site may have for Pre-K in the RFA. June also asked if the number of seats awarded depends on how many applications are received/accepted during the RFA. June expressed the issue of not having enough seats at private sites, which affects their budget as well as enrollment. June raised the question as to what impact the guaranteed seats for Murray-Massenburg will have on private sites.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Chappel responded to Ms. Shillito and explained that our goal, based on the number of 4-year-olds who reside in Durham, is to continue that growth trajectory by expanding access, by having additional children, not supplanting existing seats. • Cathy Collie-Robinson asked if families who enrolled in Durham Public School’s Pre-K classrooms still pay parent fees if they are above the guidelines. • Dr. Chappel responded to the question and confirmed that a parent fee is still assessed even if the child is enrolled in DPS Pre-K—unless the family has an identified need that would place them in support services that do not allow for fees.
Instructional Assistant Teacher Information and Compensation*	<p>Dr. Linda Chappel, Sr. Vice President, reviewed the Lead Teacher and Instructional Assistant Data</p> <p>Table 1 Compared SY 22-23 and SY 23-24 Lead Teacher and Instructional Assistants changes and overall budget.</p> <p>Table 2 Durham PreK Teachers—breakdown by Race</p> <p>Table 3 DPK Teacher Data Breakdown by Language:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 15% of lead teachers and instructional assistants speak a language other than English: • Spanish – 5 • Arabic - 2 • Hindi, Bengali – 1 • Japanese – 1 • Korean – 1 • Portuguese – 1 • Tagalog – 1 <p>96% of our DPK teachers and instructional assistants identify as female.</p> <p>Table 4 Lead Teachers by License Status and Type of Site</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DPS • Head Start • Private Sites

	<p>Table 5 Teacher Years of Experience by Site Type</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DPS • Head Start • Private Sites <p>This chart provides a good visual that all 3 program site types have about the same percentage of teachers with 0-5 years of experience but DPS definitely has the largest portion of teachers with 16+ years of experience.</p> <p><u>Discussion</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Deborah Pitman asked whether all the data provided are inclusive of both teachers and instructional assistants. • Joy Turner confirmed that all the demographic information provided is inclusive of both lead teachers and instructional assistants.
<p>Classroom Bonus*</p>	<p>Dr. Linda Chappel, Sr. Vice President, reported on the impact of the classroom bonus.</p> <p>Durham PreK Providers from the 2022-2023 school year received a survey by email on 10/24/23 to ask them about the impact of the classroom bonus that they received in June 2023. Seventeen providers, accounting for 24 sites, were sent the survey. A total of 9 providers completed the survey.</p> <p>Survey on Classroom Bonus Payments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 53% Response Rate • 100% Report classroom bonus payment was helpful for their program <p>Table 1 Providers were asked to check all the ways that they used their classroom bonus. All respondents reported using at least a portion of their bonus on classroom materials. In fact, one third indicated that classroom materials were the only thing they spent their bonus on. The next most common uses of the bonus were for teacher compensation or benefits and utilities, rent, or other overhead costs.</p> <p>Table 2 Providers were asked what the most important use for the classroom payment was. The majority of respondents (67%) stated that classroom materials were the most important use for their bonus payment.</p>

	<p><u>Discussion</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Kristi Snuggs pointed out that these data demonstrate the need for stabilization grants, such as those provided by NCDCEE through federal ARPA funding. The top 3 uses for the classroom bonuses were for classroom materials, teacher compensation, and utilities/rent.
<p>DPK Payment Model & Preservice Payment*</p>	<p>Dr. Linda Chappel, Sr. Vice President reviewed the payment policy, preservice payments, and survey results.</p> <p>In May 2023, Governance Changed the Payment Model and Approved an Additional Preservice Payment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Calculated at 15% of the site’s maximum annual Durham PreK payment based on allocated seats and current teacher license status • Post pandemic, in ST23 – 24, payments made throughout the 10-month school year returned to being based on child enrollment/attendance • As of December 2023, the overall Durham PreK vacancy rate was around 7% • The preservice payments are designed to provide additional funds to make up for/ compensate for about a 10% vacancy rate <p>In December 2023, all Durham PreK providers were invited to complete a survey regarding the impact of the new Durham PreK payment model on their programs. Each provider received an email on 12/7/23 with a link to the survey and an individualized summary of their estimated annual payments based on the new payment model with a comparison to what they would have received if we had been paying by the previous method of allocations.</p> <p>Preservice Payment Spending Breakdown: Providers were asked to list all of the ways that they used their preservice payment. Four providers indicated only using the preservice payment on one item (3 on Pre-K classroom materials and 1 on teacher compensation/bonuses) while the remaining 10 indicated multiple uses of the payment. The two most common uses of the preservice payment were for classroom materials (79%) and teacher compensation/bonuses (50%).</p> <p>Providers were asked, did the new payment model help alleviate concerns about their program’s vacancy rate for this school year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Responses to this question were evenly split with exactly half of providers saying that yes, the preservice payment did alleviate their concerns regarding their program’s vacancy rate and the other half saying no, their concerns were not alleviated. • Providers were given the chance to elaborate on their response to this question. One stated that the preservice payment did help alleviate their concerns regarding their vacancy rate because it provided support for paying teachers’ salaries while

	<p>providing time for their enrollment to grow. Another stated that their concerns were not alleviated because they have consistently seen low enrollment in the past few years. This provider stated that the only reason their enrollment is as high as it is currently is due to their own efforts in recruitment. They mentioned that their site is particularly small so any vacancy has a significant impact on their reimbursement.</p>
<p>Summary and Adjournments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The meeting adjourned at 11:29am. <p>Future Meeting Dates- 9:30 – 11:30 am</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • March 21, 2024 - Virtual • May 16, 2024 – In person meeting with lunch provided after the meeting; virtual participation also available. To be held at the Jim and Carolyn Hunt Early Childhood Resource Center, located at 1201 South Briggs Avenue in Durham.

**** Agenda items with handouts***