

Durham PreK Governance Committee Meeting NOTES
Held virtually on September 21st, 2023 (9:30am-11:30am)

In Attendance, listed in random order:

Voting Members: Dr. Wykeshia Glass, Dr. Kimberly Sowell, Joy Spencer, Kate Goodwin, Xavier Cason, June Shillito, Darnella Warthen, Dr. Deborah Pitman

Non-voting Members: Dr. Kristi Snuggs, Dr. Linda Chappel, Donna Rewalt, Tammorah Mathis, Monnie Griggs, Tosh Adams, Jena Fuchs, Joy Turner, Sara Glenn, Dr. Danielle Johnson-Offei; **Guests:** Katherine Brandt, Maggie West

WHAT	NOTES
Welcome and Introductions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome and Introductions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Recording of the meeting can be found on our DPK YouTube channel ○ Dr. Wykeshia Glass convened the meeting as the Governance Committee’s Secretary, in the absence of Dr. Iheoma Iruku, Chair of the Committee ○ Dr. Glass and Dr. Linda Chappel , Sr. Vice President for Triangle Area Child Care Resource and Referral and Durham PreK Project Lead, welcomed Dr. Deborah Pitman, Assistant Superintendent of Specialized Services for Durham Public Schools as the new DPS designated voting member of the Governance Committee. Dr. Pitman represents Superintendent Mubanga on this group as the former designee, Dr. Nakia Hardy, Associate Superintendent, moved out of Durham to become a Superintendent. Donna Rewalt, Director of Durham County Cooperative Extension was also welcomed as a new non-voting member, replacing Cate Elander, the former Durham County Early Childhood Coordinator. ○ All members then took turns introducing themselves
Meeting Objectives	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approve Meeting Notes • Share Program Activity Updates • Receive Parent and Family Feedback • Understand the Credentials and Compensation for Instructional Staff • Review Apprenticeship Program • Consider Services for Durham’s 3-Year Olds
Action Item	No proposed edits to the May 2022 meeting notes. Notes will be voted for approval at the November 2023 meeting.

**Durham PreK
Program
Update***

- Members viewed a slideshow showing pictures of open houses, home visits, and the first day of school from various sites.

Tammorah Mathis, Director of Durham PreK, reviewed the following highlights from the DPK update that was provided in the meeting handouts:

- As of September 1, 2023 a total of 1,614 applications had been received through our universal application platform and 846 families had accepted their placement offers
- A new partnership has been established with the Bull City Sigmas. The Outreach Team is collaborating with the Sigmas on a National Night Out Event at Cornwallis Apartments on 10/3/23. The Sigmas also supported our Summer Institute event by providing fifteen \$25 gift cards for a teacher raffle.
- Our Annual Summer Institute was held in August. 7 Directors, 34 Lead Teachers, and 21 Instructional Assistants attended. The event included training on building relationships with families, managing challenging behaviors, implicit bias and cultural sensitivity, as well as NC Pre-K and DPK expectations. There were also built-in networking opportunities provided with educational institutions.
- Congratulated White Rock Child Development Center on their 25 years of service to the Durham Community.
- Members were reminded that the long-term goal for Durham PreK is to help reach the community goal of serving 75% of the 4 year old census through universal pre-k services by enhancing existing pre-k services and creating new seats. Local dollars (county funding) will be reported to the Governance Committee throughout the school year.
- Showed members information on current seat types and totals. Reviewed different seat types and braiding.
- 34 DPK only seats have been added this year, in part due to a new site being funded this year, which is the biggest increase from last year.
- A total of 635 seats across 25 sites are being supported with local Durham PreK funds this year, up from 604 seats and 24 sites last school year.

Joy Turner, Director of Data and Provider Services, reviewed the Preservice Payment information

- The Preservice Payment is a new payment approved at the May 2023 Governance Committee meeting.
- The payment is calculated at 15% of a site's maximum annual Durham PreK reimbursement.
- The payment is designed to help with cash flow at the beginning of the year since sites do not receive their first payment for attendance until the end of September, and to help account for some vacancies throughout the year.
- 18 out of 25 DPK sites are under contract as of 9/14/23 and have received their preservice payment.
- 11 sites received their preservice payments in August and 7 sites received it in September, dependent upon contract completion

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Only 1 private site and all 6 DPS sites do not have executed contracts at this time. Sites will receive their preservice payment once their contract is finalized. The median preservice payment for those made to date is \$22,612. • Providers will be surveyed on the impact of the preservice payments and those survey results will be shared with the Governance Committee. <p><u>Discussion</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Darnella Warthen asked if the providers who have not yet received their preservice payments are still eligible. Joy Turner clarified that they are and they will receive their payments upon completion of contracting. • Dr. Chappel reminded members that we do not know of any other public preschool program offering sites preservice payments and that we hope it helps to support beginning of the year costs for our providers, most of which are small businesses. • In addition to the preservice payment, each classroom received \$2,896 in unrestricted supply funds in June to restock their classrooms. There were 39 classrooms for a total expense of \$112,944. • Darnella thanked the committee for this investment.
<p>SY22-23 Family Survey Results</p>	<p>Katherine Brandt, Provider Supplements and Data Manager, reviewed the results of the 22-23 Durham PreK Family Satisfaction Survey.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Durham PreK family satisfaction survey was conducted May 2023 via phone and online, in English and Spanish • There was a 29.73% completion rate • Most questions were analyzed by race, ethnicity, family income, and home language • Results were generally similar across groups • Hard to compare groups due to different sizes • For the question, “How would you rate your overall experience with Durham PreK?” almost everyone, 93%, said they had a “good” or “very good” experience. This question was broken down by home language, income, and race. No group had less than 90% of respondents answering “good” or very “good”, which is generally true across all questions. • 93% said they would recommend Durham PreK to a friend or fellow family • When asked, “What would be the most important change we could make to Durham PreK that would make the program more accessible to families in Durham?”, 32% answered transportation and 30% answered wrap care • 93% agreed that their child is more prepared for kindergarten as a result of participating in Durham PreK • When asked to rate preparedness on a scale from 1 to 5, the most common response was 5 (very prepared) • The following family quotes stood out from the survey: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>“For me it has served me and my daughter very much. She has learned a lot. And we are very content. My daughter would go to PreK Monday through Sunday if she could. She loves it very much.”</i>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>"Prek has opened my eyes to see how smart kids are. They want to learn a lot of things. My daughter learned a lot this year. She learned a lot about gardening, and plants. She cries if she can't go to PreK".</i> ○ <i>"I'm a single mother of three. PreK has helped me continue working. And stay at the job too. It made me more steady and provide more stability".</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Members were invited to ask questions and to reach out if they want any further details about the survey data.
<p>SY22-23 Teacher Bonus Impact</p>	<p>Katherine Brandt reviewed the results of the Teacher Bonus Survey.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Lead teachers and instructional assistants received a \$4,000 bonus last school year (some were pro-rated but most received the full amount) ● 62% completion rate (49 of 79 teachers) ● 96% teaching in the same classroom ● 100% reported: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The bonus helped me feel more satisfied with my job. ○ The bonus helped ease my financial stress. ○ The bonus encouraged me to stay with my current program. ○ The bonus made me feel more appreciated & recognized for my work. ● Teachers reported that the bonus helped them to: pay bills; address basic needs of their family; address transportation needs; create or add money to their savings; address health needs of their family; afford family recreation, gifts, or personal rewards
<p>SY23-24 Teacher Information and Compensation</p>	<p>Katherine Brandt reviewed teacher information and compensation support payment data. All data excludes one private site and all Durham Public Schools sites. Aggregated data will be update when the information becomes available.</p> <p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Excluding DPS, there are 29 Lead Teachers and 29 Instructional Assistants. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 74% Black ○ 10% Latine ○ 97% women ● 13.8% are multilingual <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Spanish: 5 ○ Hindi: 1 ○ Bengali: 1 ○ Korean: 1 ○ Portuguese: 1

Credentials

- Lead Teacher credentials (excluding DPS)
 - Continuing licenses are most common, followed by residency licenses
 - There are currently 9 teachers with no current BK license. Teachers without a license are enrolled and/or receiving and support through training and technical assistance in obtaining their license.
- The average number of years of experience for Lead Teachers is 8.1 years. This may change when DPS information is received, given that the school system often has more experienced teachers.

Supplement Payments

- Members were reminded that teachers with Birth – Kindergarten teaching licenses have higher pay standards than those still working towards their license. To help providers help offset the cost of employing highly qualified teachers, CCSA provides salary support payments for sites to pay these teachers.
- Looked at table comparing last school year to this school year that showed 54% of teachers were eligible for their employer to receive a support payment last year and 63% of teachers are eligible this year
- One reason for this increase is because this is the first year for which residency and provisional licenses are eligible for these payments whereas in previous years, only teachers with initial and continuing licenses were eligible.
- Dr. Chappel clarified for newer members that all Durham PreK lead teachers, whether they work in a public school site, private site, or Head Start site, are required to be paid on the Durham Public Schools scale. The support payments are provided to sites towards their budget, not directly to teachers. We will update members when we receive information from Durham Public Schools (typically received later in the school year).
- *Projected* spending for this year, which includes the information we had for DPS this past June, is \$976 per teacher and \$263,536 for the school year for support payments. We are still operating on the previous state budget and salary scale which will be updated as soon as NC has a state budget. We will share this information again once we have updates.

Teacher Salary & Benefits

- For lead teachers, pay is related to their license and years of experience. The minimum salary for current Durham PreK teachers is \$37,000. The highest is \$63,976. The median salary is \$45,605 and the average is \$48,700.
- For instructional assistants, the required minimum is \$17.60/hour (which is the livable wage in Durham), the current maximum for the group is \$23.00/hour, the median is \$18.36/hour, and the average is \$18.98/hour.
- Data regarding staff benefits was collected this year through contracting.
 - Paid leave
 - All DPK providers have 6+ paid holidays for their staff.
 - They also all provide vacation days (21% offer 1-5 days, 79% offer 6+ days).

- Sick leave varies with 16% of providers not offering sick leave, 53% offering 1-5 days, and 32% offering 6+ days.
- Insurance at least partially paid by employer
 - Health, 79%
 - Dental, 47%
 - Vision, 42%
- Retirement
 - 95% of DPK providers offer retirement with contributions from employer
 - For 84%, employer contribution depend on employee contributions
- Waiting periods – the most common waiting period for benefits is 90 days from start date

Discussion

- Dr. Chappel mentioned that compensation continues to be an area of concern in the early childhood field at large and that the Governance Committee has made many decisions that are key to supporting compensation.
- Dr. Kimberly Sowell asked if we can survey teachers on their satisfaction of the benefits they receive to help us identify areas of improvement.
- Darnella asked about the difference between our supplement and the additional pay received by high-performing school districts by the state. Dr. Chappel explained that state enhancements or bonuses for certain schools are not incorporated into the Durham Public School salary scale, which is what Durham PreK follows. We do not have a provision regarding state bonuses and are not connected to that. The supplement [teacher support payments] Katherine was referring to arose from the intentional planning of the Governance Committee at the beginning of Durham PreK and the commitment to not creating a program where only initially licensed teachers or teachers working towards their license were hired because their salaries were lower. Governance wanted to level the playing field and support providers in attracting highly educated, experienced teachers. The teacher support payments are given to sites with B-K licensed teachers each month on top of their monthly per-child payment.
- Darnella commented that staff retention is still a struggle and said that though the bonuses help, we can hopefully continue to support this area.
- Donna Rewalt asked if there is any information on parental or maternity leave for our child care providers. She also mentioned that the paid leave information concerns her, especially as it relates to sick leave. She noted the current CDC recommendation that individuals who test positive for Covid isolate for 5 days and wonders how that is being handled. She worries about teachers putting off care or not taking care of themselves and recommends that when we survey teachers to ask about the things they may be experiencing as a result of having limited benefits.
- Katherine said that based on last year’s survey, 15 sites reported offering job-protected parental leave. We did not ask if that was paid or unpaid. Dr. Chappel said we can review the questions we ask on that topic and review our requirements to report

	<p>back to Governance. She also mentioned that until last year, the minimum hourly pay for instructional assistants was \$15/hour and is now \$17.60.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • June Shillito mentioned that her teacher has shared with her that she is very happy at their site but one thing that would potentially pull her away are the benefits offered by DPS, which private providers cannot compete with. She also mentioned that during the height of the pandemic, they were paying their staff for being out with Covid but they could afford to because they were getting money from the state. She said they are not doing that anymore but will need to rethink that as cases are increasing again.
<p>Member Recruitment and Nominations</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New Governance Committee members will begin in November 2023 • Nominations have been received for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Parent ○ Non-profit Leaders (2) ○ Non-profit DPK Early Education Site Board Member • We will accept additional nominations until October 15 • At the November meeting, we will need to select a new Chair and Vice-Chair • Dr. Chappel reminded members that the November meeting will be in-person with a virtual option and boxed lunch will be offered. We will take nominations in any category but could specifically use a nomination for a business leader. Dr. Iruka let us know last year that she would not be able to continue as our Chair this year. Leigh Bordley who was our Vice Chair has transitioned into the health field and has resigned. We welcome anyone who is interested in either position and will make the transition to leadership as easy as possible.
<p>Apprenticeship & Workforce Support</p>	<p>Maggie West, Durham PreK Workforce Manager, provided members with an overview of updates for the apprenticeship program.</p> <p>Goals:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design comprehensive supports for current and aspiring early childhood educators to earn higher degrees totally debt-free and grow in their careers • Actively recruit new professionals to the field, build interest in the profession, and create new/accelerated pathways into the field • Increase the number of early childhood educators who identify as Latine and are fluent in Spanish, in alignment with the Durham PreK Equity Plan • Meaningfully support partnering child care providers to recruit and retain highly qualified staff <p>Scope:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To build workforce capacity in Durham to provide high-quality early education and to support Durham’s universal preschool effort, the program will support current and aspiring educators pursuing Associate or Bachelor’s degrees. • Intentional focus on supporting Durham PreK sites and educators, but also open to any licensed sites in Durham.

Basic Components:

- 30+ hours paid work per week
- Structured on the job training
- Related instruction at institution of higher education, Durham Tech, NC Central, and UNC Greensboro
- Nationally recognized credential plus college credit/degree
- Progressive Wage Increases based on Achievement of Milestones

Supporting Organizations:

- Apprenticeship NC - Registers apprenticeship programs, Supports program design to align with labor standards for apprenticeship
- Building Bright Futures - Statewide funding resource to support early childhood apprenticeship programs, Offers financial resources to apprentices, mentors, and employers
- Community Colleges & University Partners - Provide related instruction for apprenticeship programs, leading to academic credit and college degrees at the Associate and Bachelor's level, Provide academic advising
- Child Care Services Association - Statewide: TEACH Early Childhood scholarships available to support apprentices/employers, In Durham: Sponsoring apprenticeship programs

Benefits for participants:

- Free college degree
- Better pay, built in raises
- Support from mentors
- College coursework aligned with on the job learning
- Flexible resources such as transportation, transcript translation, technology, etc.
- Support current or aspiring early childhood educators

Benefits for employers:

- Salary reimbursement of 50% of wages for apprentices pursuing up to an Associate Degree (Reimbursement from Building Bright Futures, state-funded program)
- Improved pathways for teacher recruitment and retention
- Increased opportunities for staff advancement and leadership development
- Reimbursed for paid release time by T.E.A.C.H.
- Stipends and free professional development for mentors

Interest thus far:

- Since recruitment began in June, there have been 108 people who expressed interest so far, 79 interested in apprenticeship and 29 supported through T.E.A.C.H.
- 78% are currently working in ECE, 22% are seeking opportunity in ECE

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 48 will be working towards an Associate Degree, 9 will re-enroll, 10 are already enrolled, and 11 will work towards a Bachelor’s Degree <p>Collaborative strategies for Latino participant recruitment & comprehensive support:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collaborate with El Centro Hispano, LEAP, and current bilingual educators to recruit and support participants in cohorts • Develop low-barrier opportunities for community members to explore career ECE pathways • Promote Spanish-language courses available in Early Childhood Education at Durham Tech • Collaboratively provide holistic, person-centered support to smooth enrollment processes and promote college success for English Language Learners • Recruit Family, Friend, and Neighbor (FFN) providers, parents, and other community caregivers who have an interest in a career in early childhood education, and support degree attainment and compensation growth • Applied as a collaborative to participate in National Early Care and Educator Workforce Center Communities of Practice to develop/hone strategies <p>Other models we have been learning from:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WakeWorks Apprenticeship • T.E.A.C.H. National Center • Southwestern Child Development Commission • Charlotte Bilingual Preschool • Early Care & Education Pathways to Success <p>Looking ahead:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Official registration of sponsored program anticipated by end of September • Invitation to a celebratory apprenticeship signing day for our first group of Associate Degree apprentices and partnering employers (in October/November, depending on date of program registration) • Recruitment ongoing (rolling) for partnering employers, apprentices, and mentors • Deep dive into Bachelor’s Degree Apprenticeship design with university partners to develop this program
<p>Planning for Future Services</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr. Chappel provided members with context about why Durham PreK began with services to four year olds and asked the group to consider whether members feel it is time to pilot services for three year olds. • Members broke out into two groups to discuss this potential initiative and complete a Jamboard <p><u>Jamboard Suggestions & Questions</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Data requested on where we are with our goal of serving 75% of the four year old census in Durham • Requested a current overview of services to 3 year olds in Durham • Requested cost estimates • Do we need to address the barriers to our current services for 4 year olds before piloting a three year old program?

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need to consider curriculum and professional development needs • Does this conversation include DPS pre-k programs? • Ensure intentional planning for improving and tracking the application process to support additional children • Is there an indication that most families return to the same program (for programs currently offering services to 3 year olds)? • Would we have combined classrooms with 3 and 4 year olds? • We need a plan and statement to families regarding intention related to wrap care and transportation • Consider paid summer program for 3 year olds entering pre-k in the fall <p><u>Discussion</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sara Glenn and Joy Spencer asked what percent of 4 year olds we are currently serving. Dr. Chappel said the last couple of years we have been hovering a little over 30% of our goal. We will be able to share updated data and have more discussion about this in November.
<p>Summary and Adjournments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The meeting was adjourned at 11:32am. <p>Future Meeting Dates- 9:30 – 11:30 am</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • November 16, 2023- In person meeting with lunch provided after the meeting; virtual participation also available. To be held at the Jim and Carolyn Hunt Early Childhood Resource Center, located at 1201 South Briggs Avenue in Durham. • January 18, 2024- Virtual • March 21, 2024 - Virtual • May 16, 2024 – In person with virtual also available

** Agenda items with handouts*